

**MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI**  
**MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE**  
**MINUTES OF THE TWENTY SEVENTH MEETING**

Date: **Wednesday, 19 / 08 / 2020.**

Time: 11.30 am to 12.30 pm

The following members were present:

- |                        |  |
|------------------------|--|
| • Dr. Ramanath Jha     | Chairman;                                    |
| • Dr. P.P. Bhawe       | Environmental Engineer, VJTI.                |
| • Prof. Rajiv Mishra   | Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture. |
| • Shri Sanjay Gedam    | Chief Architect, Govt. of Maharashtra.       |
| • Shri Chetan Raikar   | Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert. |
| • Dr. Kantikumar Pawar | Archaeologist / conservation expert.         |
| • Smt. Kirtida Unwalla | Conservation Architect.                      |

The following officers were in attendance:

- |                             |                           |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| • Shri Chakradhar Kandalkar | Dy. Chief Eng. (D.P.) II. |
| • Smt Aparna Bhatte         | Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.) |
| • Shri Deepak Bidve         | Sr. Architect (D.P.)      |
| • Shri Hemant Khaire        | Sr. Architect (D.P.)      |
| • Shri Rituraj Karanjkar    | Sub-eng (Architect) D.P.  |
| • Shri Dinesh Gawande       | Sub-eng (Architect) D.P.  |

Leave of absence was granted to Dr. Manjiri Kamat, Dr. Sandeep Pendhari, Prof. A. A. Bage and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee.

**A. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting:**

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting held on 31.07.2020 (26<sup>th</sup>) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

**B. The following amended proposals were considered:**

**1. Sr. No.:555**

**Grade- II-B**



## 'Mayor's Bungalow'

Proposal: - Amended proposal for construction of 'Shri Balasaheb Thackeray National Memorial' at Mayor's Bungalow plot, situated at Veer Savarkar Marg, Shivaji Park, Dadar (W) in G/N Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Shri Balasaheb Thackeray National Memorial Trust.

Architect: - M/s Abha Lambah & Associates.

Reference: i) Earlier NOC dated 05.07.2018;

ii) Submissions from architect dated 28.07.2020, 17.08.2020 and 18.08.2020;

iii) MHCC meeting dated 31.07.2020

iv) Online meeting with Memorial Trust dated 17.08.2020;

v) Site visit dated 18.08.2020.

The site u/r, located on Veer Savarkar Marg in G/N Ward, is listed at Sr. No. 555 under the name 'Mayor's Bungalow' as a Grade II-B site in the heritage list. The sea facing property comprises of a Gr. + 1 storied bungalow reflecting Neo-Classical features, ground storied servant's quarters, drivers room/garage and a huge landscaped green area around

**Earlier approval:** The proposal seeking NOC of the MHCC for construction of 'Shri Balasaheb Thackeray National Memorial' at site u/r was considered by the MHCC in its meetings dated 08.05.2018, 05.06.2018 and 03.07.2018. The site was also visited by the Committee members on 15.05.2018 and 27.06.2018. The Committee had granted its NOC for the said proposal vide letter dated 05.07.2018 comprising following scope of work:

- i) Demolition of the existing servant's quarter structures at the North-East corner of the property and demolition of the existing driver's room, shed, garage situated at the South-East corner of the property.
- ii) Demolition of the roundabout in front of the existing porch of Mayor's Bungalow structure and construction of a lower ground structure comprising art gallery, library, seminar and lecture hall, toilets and other utility areas.
- iii) Construction of a new amenity block in the North-East corner of the property in place of the existing servant's quarter area.
- iv) Provision of an open parking space at the South-East corner of the property and new hard-scape / soft-scape in the area surrounding the newly constructed structures and existing Mayor's Bungalow.
- v) The Mayor's Bungalow structure is proposed to be retained in its existing form and proposed to be used for the purpose allied to the memorial museum.

Subsequently a proposal for restoration, internal additions / alterations and change of user from residential to museum at existing Mayor's Bungalow was submitted by Architect Anil



Patil on 11.02.2019 and was considered by the MHCC in its meeting held on 27.02.2019 in which the Committee had requested structural stability assessment of the bungalow and a comprehensive restoration plan for further consideration.

**Amended proposal:** - It was informed by architect vide letter dated 28.07.2020 that the proposal has been amended on the account of inclusion of the adjacent plot of Keraliya Samaj in the proposal. The amended proposal included the following as informed by the architect:

**Entrance Block / Plaza (New addition):** - A low rise structure (2 basements+ ground floor) with a height of 4.00 M above ground level is proposed partly on Mayor's Bungalow Site and partly on Keraliya Samaj plot that acts as entrance portal to the heritage property which is also required for security screening and basement parking. The Entrance block houses the conference hall, security, ticketing, screening for the public to enter the main memorial site & other services at ground floor. In addition to that it will also have seminar / multipurpose halls and allied services at the 1st basement level. As recommended by Building Proposal Department, a 2nd level basement with adequate car parking with car lifts is included as per DCP Regulations. Adequate Fire Fighting, HVAC, Electrical, Security Systems have been provided for all structures including 2 car lifts and 2 staircases for the Entrance block to service the basement levels. Existing driver's room, shed, garage situated at this location were proposed to be demolished in earlier approved proposal.

**Interpretation Centre:** - The Interpretation Centre which is proposed mostly underground, was 3 meters away from the Porch of Heritage building in the earlier approved plan is now shifted 15 meters away from the Heritage Building. This has been done with a view to ensure that the new construction of basement is as far from the heritage building as possible to minimize impact on the heritage structure. The area of interpretation centre has also been reduced by 5000 Sq. Ft. to reduce its mass and impact on heritage structure. It is observed from submission that height of the new structure (Interpretation Centre) in front of the existing porch of the bungalow is now approx 1.00 M above surrounding ground level against earlier approved height of 0.75 M (2 ft. 6 inches).

**Museum in old Mayor's Building:** - The existing heritage structure of 'Mayor's Bungalow' is proposed to be retained for the purpose allied to the memorial museum. It is observed from submission that internal addition / alterations and addition of a lift near staircase have been proposed.



**Artist Retreat & Cafe:** - Earlier, a new amenity block in the North-East corner of the property in place of the existing servant's quarter structures. A similar new ground storied structure with sloping roof of 'Artist Retreat & Café' is now proposed at the same location.

**Discussion of the MHCC in its meeting dated 31.07.2020:** - The meeting was attended by Architect Abha Lambah and representative of the trust, Shri Sudhir Naik. It was explained by the architect that subsequent to the earlier approval of the MHCC for the Smarak building, adjacent plot has also been acquired; and in order to reduce the mass of the erstwhile approved Interpretation Centre, some activities such as seminar hall along with security screening and parking as insisted by B.P. Dept. have been planned in the new building, majority of which sits on the new plot with some part on the existing plot. The new building at entrance is planned to meet with the security / crowd management requirements and effort has been made to keep it as low as possible. The entrance portal gateway that frames the view to the heritage bungalow also provides covered space for crowd during security screening. The interpretation Centre has been shifted further away from the heritage bungalow and its b/u area has been reduced in order to minimize the impact on the heritage structure. It was also explained that height of the interpretation centre which was earlier 0.75 M has been increased to 1.00 M after consultation with structural engineer with consideration to construction, ventilation and flooding possibility. It was further explained that all structures have been planned taking into account location of existing trees at site. Shri Sudhir Naik confirmed that not a single tree is being disturbed while planning the structures.

The Committee discussed the proposal at length and it was the unanimous opinion of the Committee that for the Memorial to do justice to the memory of the venerable person as well as the heritage structure, it would be necessary that the structure should retain its original grandeur that is well preserved within its architecture and landscape setting. It should have minimal interventions while enhancing its new use in an optimal manner. The Committee after deliberations had given certain suggestions and the architect was advised to take cognizance of the same and revert at earliest. It was decided to visit the site to assess the impact of additionalities in the proposal on heritage ambience and if required, meeting with the Memorial Trust could be sought to discuss the observations / suggestions of the Committee to further enhance the architectural quality of this iconic project while preserving heritage ambience of the site.

The said matter was discussed in the online meeting dated 17.08.2020 with the representatives of Memorial Trust and the architect and it was agreed by applicant / architect to take cognizance of the suggestions of the MHCC and amend the plans accordingly. The site was also visited by the MHCC on 18.08.2020.



The architect submitted revised set of drawings on 18.08.2020. The following broad modification in the proposal was noted:

**Entrance Block / Plaza:** Height of entrance canopy structure has been increased to 6.00M to allow more visibility of Mayor's Bungalow.

**Interpretation Centre:** - Height of interpretation centre has been increased to 1.20M on technical grounds.

**Mayor's Bungalow:** - Internal addition / alterations are proposed. Existing lift in the bungalow is proposed to be retained and a new lift is proposed to be constructed near central staircase. Façade and roof restoration of the bungalow is now proposed.

**Discussion of the MHCC in today's meeting:** - In continuation with the earlier meetings / discussions and site visit, the following broad modifications in the proposal were agreed upon by the applicant and the MHCC:

- 1) In order to preserve the visual connection of the heritage bungalow from the street and maintain its grandeur, the height of entrance portal canopy is increased to 6.00 M which frames the heritage bungalow.
- 2) It was noticed that the Mayor's bungalow already has one operational lift which is now proposed to be retained and proposal of new lift at centre will be cancelled.
- 3) The MHCC was of the opinion that site is bestowed with the natural heritage which forms an integral part of its heritage ambience. The Committee advised that no tree should be cut / harmed in any manner and if at all under unavoidable circumstances any tree needs to be transplanted, prior intimation to the MHCC should be given.
- 4) In terms of interpretation centre the MHCC accepted the revised location and plans along with its revised height of 1.20 M which was requirement of architect on technical grounds. The Committee advised that due consideration should be given to flooding possibility and utmost care should be taken in this regard.

The Committee, after due consideration of all aspects, decided to grant its NOC, purely from heritage point of view, for the proposal of construction of 'Shri Balasaheb Thackeray National Memorial' at Mayor's Bungalow plot u/r subject to incorporating aforesaid decisions in the proposal drawings and following conditions:

- i) that, structural stability of the existing Mayor's Bungalow should be ensured;
- ii) that, restoration of Mayor's Bungalow should be carried out as per conservation norms and expert supervision;
- iii) that, no tree should be cut / harmed in any manner and if at all under unavoidable circumstances any tree needs to be transplanted, prior intimation to the MHCC should be given;



- iv) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and authenticity / approvability of the proposal including amalgamation of plots, open space, FSI, parking requirement etc. should be examined & confirmed by the concerned B.P. Dept in accordance with the prevailing DCPR and policies in force. All other applicable permissions should be obtained from concerned authorities.
- v) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained on completion of said work at site.

The architect was requested to submit final sets of drawings incorporating the aforesaid decision of the MHCC for formal approval.

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the chair.



**Chairman**  
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee