

**MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI**

**MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF THE TWENTY FIFTH MEETING**

Date: **Tuesday, 21 / 07 / 2020.**

Time: 11.00 am to 12.30 pm

The following members were present:

- |                        |  |
|------------------------|--|
| • Dr. Ramanath Jha     | Chairman;                                    |
| • Dr. Manjiri Kamat    | Historian, Mumbai University.                |
| • Dr. P.P. Bhave       | Environmental Engineer, VJTI.                |
| • Prof. Rajiv Mishra   | Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture. |
| • Shri Sanjay Gedam    | Chief Architect, Govt. of Maharashtra.       |
| • Shri Chetan Raikar   | Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert. |
| • Dr. Kantikumar Pawar | Archaeologist / conservation expert.         |
| • Smt. Kirtida Unwalla | Conservation Architect.                      |

The following officers were in attendance:

- |                             |                           |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| • Shri Chakradhar Kandalkar | Dy. Chief Eng. (D.P.) II. |
| • Smt Aparna Bhatte         | Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.) |
| • Shri Deepak Bidve         | Sr. Architect (D.P.)      |
| • Shri Rituraj Karanjkar    | Sub-eng (Architect) D.P.  |
| • Shri Dinesh Gawande       | Sub-eng (Architect) D.P.  |

Leave of absence was granted to Dr. Sandeep Pendhari, Prof. A. A. Bage and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee.

**A. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting:**

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting held on 07.07.2020 & 13.07.2020 (24<sup>th</sup>) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

**B. The following old proposals were considered:**

1. Sr. No.:146/7

**Grade: II-A & Precinct**



## **'Mumbai Coastal Road Package IV'**

Proposal: - Prescription of RL on part portion of N.S. Road abutting Hindu gymkhana & other gymkhanas, for construction of Mumbai Coastal Road package IV from Princess Street flyover to Priyadarshini Park, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Dy. Ch. E (Traffic) / Ch.E.(Coastal Road).

Reference: - i) CHE/1268/DP-DyMA dated 16.06.2020;

ii) NOC of the MHCC dated 28.10.2016;

iii) MHCC meetings dated 26.06.2020, 07.07.2020&13.07.2020.

The prescribed R.L. on part portion of N.S. Road for construction of Mumbai Coastal Road package IV is situated within Marine Drive Precinct and abuts /affects the heritage sites of Hindu Gymkhana and all other gymkhanas along the road up to Taraporwala Aquarium.

**Earlier NOC:** - The MHCC had granted its NOC vide letter dated 28.10.2016 for revised alignment of the Mumbai Coastal Road project at 'Marine Drive' and near 'Bandra Fort' with suggestion to submit alignment and tunnel details etc separately in due course for consideration of the MHCC.

**Instant proposal:** - Reference is given to the letter from Ch.E (Coastal Road) regarding the work of construction of Mumbai Coastal Road from Princess Street flyover to Bandra Worli Sea-link, which is in progress. As per the said note the alignment of part portion of service road abutting various Gymkhanas situated at Marine Drive is required for Coastal Road work i.e mainly for cut and cover tunnel, ramp portion and for merging lane with N.S. Road. It is also informed that this is only portion available for expansion of south bound carriageway near Hindu Gymkhana where service road is narrow. Due to which after utilization of part portion of service road for Coastal Road, effective average width of service road will be 1.40 m at Hindu Gymkhana for vehicular & pedestrian movement which may cause congestion on service road and hence requires widening of service road.

It is informed that total width of existing road is 50m approx. and it is proposed to prescribe R.L of same width to N.S. road from points (A) to (B) as marked on submitted drawing. The proposed widening affects the land of Hindu Gymkhana and petrol pump at junction. It is further informed that area of setback is very minor and no trees are affected in the setback due to road widening. The remarks of the MHCC have been sought for the said proposal.

**Discussion of the MHCC in its meeting held on 26.06.2020:** - The proposal was presented by the officials from Coastal Road dept. and it was informed that as the alignment cannot be accommodated at seaward side due to technical limitations, option of widening existing service road has been proposed. The Committee was of the opinion that the Marine Drive Precinct is one of the significant heritage landmarks of the City and its openness and





ambience needs to be preserved. The Committee was not amenable about forfeiting open space of Gymkhana for the purpose and inquired whether any other alternative could be worked out. The Committee also expressed concern about existing trees / vegetation along the service road. The Committee decided to visit the site for better understanding and requested Coastal Road / Traffic dept. to make detailed presentation for the said proposal in next MHCC meeting.

**Discussion of the MHCC in its meeting dated 07.07.2020 & 13.07.2020:** - The detailed proposal of the Mumbai Coastal Road package IV was explained by the Ch.E. (Coastal Rod) & consultant of the project. It was explained that as per the proposed alignment of the coastal road and to maintain the uniform width of the service road, some portion of Hindu Gymkhana land (4.2m-4.7m from present boundary of Gymkhana) and some portion of existing petrol pump is required for the said work. It was also explained that utmost efforts have been taken to minimize the impact on heritage sites and road edge is maintained at the boundary of other adjacent gymkhanas. However the portion u/r of the Hindu gymkhana is slightly protruding out hence it comes under prescribed R.L. for maintaining the alignment of the road. It was also explained that large open spaces about 10 ha is being created near Priyadarshini Park in 'D' Ward and total about 70 ha green open space is being created in Mumbai Coastal Road Project in D & G South Wards. It was also explained that attempt will be made to transplant the affected trees due to coastal road project at marine drive along the boundaries of gymkhana subject to their permission.

The aforesaid points were noted by the Committee. However, considering the heritage significance of the area u/r the Committee was of the opinion that more deliberations are required in this case before reaching to any decision. The MHCC decided to form a Sub-Committee including Prof. Rajeev Mishra, Prof. P.P. Bhave, Shri Sanjay Gedam and Shri Chetan Raikar and the applicant was requested to discuss the details of the proposal with the Sub-Committee.

Accordingly, the proposal was discussed by the Sub-Committee on 15.07.2020 when officials from Coastal Road dept. and representatives of project consultants / contractors were present.

**Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting:** - The findings and recommendation of the Sub-Committee were noted in today's meeting. Additional point about the possibility of parking space shortage for Gymkhanas during events / functions was also discussed. After deliberations, the Committee was of the opinion that, considering project requirement and technical constraints, the proposed option is the least intrusive solution in context of the heritage. In the larger interest of public and city mobility, the Committee decided to grant its



NOC purely from heritage point of view, specifically for the instant proposal of prescribed R.L. subject to the following:

i) that, pedestrian movement along the Gymkhanas should not be discontinued during the construction phase of the project. The facility for pedestrian movement should be uninterrupted provided with necessary safety & security measures.

ii) that, along with transplanting existing trees as proposed, additional trees should also be planted along the footpath and boundaries in between Gymkhanas, with prior consent of concerned authorities and owners.

iii) that, aspect of parking for the Gymkhanas should be looked into and feasible solutions should be worked out in consultation with owners.

iv) that, all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities / owners should be obtained.

**2. Sr. No.:95**

**Grade- I**

**'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters'**

Proposal: Proposed installation of the lift at main building and reconstruction / restoration of ancillary blocks in the premises of 'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters' situated at Shahid Bhagat Singh Road near S.P.Mukherjee Chowk, 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: Ex.Eng. Presidency Division, PWD, Mumbai.

Consultant: Ms.Abha Lambah, Conservation Architect

Reference: i) Application u/no Che/26172/20.01.2020;

ii) MHCC NOC dated 09.07.2019;

iii) MHCC meetings dated 29.01.2020, 07.07.2020&13.07.2020;

iv) Site visit dated 17.02.2020.

**Location / Heritage Status:** - The site u/r is listed at Sr. No. 95 as a Grade-I structure in the heritage list. The building designed by F.W.Stevens and built in 1872 – 76 was originally constructed to provide accommodation for the seamen and officers. The building is currently being used as the State Police Head Quarters.

Earlier, the Committee had granted its NOC for restoration of the main building of 'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters' vide letter dated 09.07.2019. The Committee had advised checking approvability of the new proposed structure at rear side abutting compound wall. The architect had informed that the new building would be omitted from this proposal and separate proposal for the same would be put up in due course.

**The proposal:** - The scope of work as envisaged by applicant was as follows:





- i) Demolition of existing lift near central staircase and installation of new external lift by altering existing openings at rear side corridor.
- ii) Proposed restoration and redesign / reconstruction of existing amenity blocks within the campus. The existing structures of security block and seating area abutting rear boundary are proposed to be reconstructed with a new G+1 structure with sloping roof. The existing structures of BEST substation and officers' restroom are proposed to be restored with replacement of existing RCC columns at front with historical wooden columns, restoration of door / windows as per historical details and stone cladding to existing walls.

**Discussion of the Committee in its meeting dated 29.01.2020:** - The proposal was presented by the representative of architect. The Committee requested applicant to submit rear side elevation, details/specifications of lift and roof plans along with photographs for better understanding of the impact of proposed lift on aesthetics of the building. In terms of the reconstruction of the amenity blocks, the Committee was of the opinion that built mass within the Grade-I heritage site should be ideally avoided. Also as advised earlier the applicant was requested to confirm authenticity / approvability regarding reconstruction of amenity blocks u/r from concerned B.P. dept. The Committee considering heritage significance of the site also decided to visit the site for assessing the impact of proposed works on heritage fabric of site.

**Discussion of the Committee in its meeting dated 07.07.2020 & 13.07.2020:** - The site was visited by the MHCC on 17.02.2020 and observations were noted in today's meeting. The proposal was explained by the architect specifically for the proposed restoration and redesign / reconstruction of existing amenity blocks near the entrance. The Committee reiterated its previous view that additional built mass within the Grade-I heritage site should be ideally avoided and the architect was requested to first confirm authenticity / approvability regarding reconstruction of amenity blocks u/r from concerned B.P. dept.

**Discussion of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The proposal was discussed in continuation with the earlier meeting. It was noted by the MHCC that earlier, a new lift at rear side of main building was proposed and the existing lift was proposed to be demolished. However, the details / specifications of the proposed lift were found unsatisfactory. Considering the heritage significance of the structure, the Committee opined that other possible options for location of the lift, justifying the circulation / accessibility, may also be explored. Moreover, the Committee noted that the proposal submitted was inadequate in terms of information. A comprehensive proposal including lift specifications / materials,



elevational details and its structural report should be submitted for consideration of the MHCC in next meeting.

**C. The following new proposals were then considered:**

**1. Sr. No.:384**

**Grade- Precinct**

**'Banganga Precinct (Temples & Tank)'**

Proposal: Proposed reconstruction of 'Municipal Dispensary and staff quarters' on plot bearing C.S. No.18 of Malabar Hill Division, Banganga in 'D' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: Municipal Architect

Reference: Che/2109/DP-DyMA dated 09.07.2020.

**Location / Heritage Status:** - The site u/r is part of 'Banganga Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 384 of the heritage list. The 'Banganga Tank' is listed as a Grade I site.

It was informed by applicant that existing G+ 4 storied dispensary has been demolished due to its dilapidated condition and a new G+4 storied dispensary building is now proposed on same footprint.

**Decision of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The proposal was presented by officials from Municipal Architect dept. It was explained that the erstwhile building was demolished when plot u/r was not part of the 'Banganga Precinct'. The new building is now proposed on similar footprint & height, thereby maintaining earlier skyline, mass and fabric of the precinct. The Committee after due consideration found the proposal, including elevational treatment, approvable from heritage point of view and decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view subject to the following:

- i) that, elevational treatment as approved by the MHCC should be faithfully implemented;
- ii) that, the colour scheme for external facades should be in harmony with the Precinct character / surrounding heritage buildings, preferably light pastel shades should be used;
- iii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;
- iv) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained after completion of work at site.

**2. Sr. No.:489 & 495**

**Grade- II-A**

**'Kamgar Maidan & Bhiwanji Nare Park'**





Proposal: Proposed construction of coffer dams and mandaps for Ganapati Idol immersion at Bhiwanji Nare Park maidan & Kamgar Maidan in beat no.203 of F/S Ward.

Applicant: Assistant Commissioner F/S Ward.

Reference: Application u/no Che/2363/14.07.2020;

The site u/r of 'Kamgar Maidan' is listed at Sr. No. 489 under Grade-IIA and 'Bhiwanji Nare Park' is listed at Sr. No. 495 under Grade-IIA in the sanctioned heritage list of F/S Ward.

**Proposal:** - Reference was given to the letter from local councilor Smt. Sindhu Masulkar regarding provision of artificial pond for Ganapati Idol immersion at said sites. It was informed that due to present pandemic situation this year, immersion of house hold Ganapati idol in artificial pond is required for maintaining social distancing norms as per Govt. regulations.

The proposal contemplates construction of an artificial tank of size 12m X 6m & 1.6m depth for immersion of idols along with a Mandap structure of 3m X 5m.

**Decision of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The Committee was given to understand that the construction of tank and mandap is of temporary nature. Considering the present situation and nature of work, the Committee decided to grant its consent for the said proposal purely from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

- i) that, trees, if any, at site u/r should not be harmed in any way during execution of the work;
- i) that, surplus earth, if any, after the intended use of tank should be utilized / disposed of properly as per the law;
- ii) that, ecological documentation / study for the project shall be prepared and submitted to the MHCC in due course of time;
- iii) that, this NOC is granted purely from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions should be obtained from concerned depts.

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the chair.



**Chairman**  
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee